

D R A F T
FOR DISCUSSION ONLY

Public Meetings During Emergencies Act

Uniform Law Commission

February 26, 2021 Video Committee Meeting



Copyright © 2021
National Conference of Commissioners on Uniform State Laws

This draft, including the proposed statutory language and any comments or reporter's notes, has not been reviewed or approved by the Uniform Law Commission or the drafting committee. It does not necessarily reflect the views of the Uniform Law Commission, its commissioners, the drafting committee, or the committee's members or reporter.

February 19, 2021

Public Meetings During Emergencies Act

The Committee appointed by and representing the Uniform Law Commission in preparing this act consists of the following individuals:

Mark F. Glaser	New York, <i>Chair</i>
Claire Levy	Colorado, <i>Vice Chair</i>
Emma Buck	Virginia
Jennifer S.N. Clark	North Dakota
Paul J. DeMarco	Alabama
Brian K. Flowers	District of Columbia
Patricia Brumfield Fry	Missouri
Othni J. Lathram	Alabama
Blake K. Oshiro	Hawaii
Fred C. Patton	Kansas
Frank E. Perez	Texas
Larry L. Ruth	Nebraska
Jerod E. Tufte	North Dakota
V. David Zvenyach	Wisconsin
William H. Henning	Alabama, <i>Division Chair</i>
Carl H. Lisman	Vermont, <i>President</i>

Other Participants

Richard Briffault	New York, <i>Reporter</i>
Michael T. Kamprath	Florida, <i>American Bar Association Advisor</i>
Nora Winkelman	Pennsylvania, <i>Style Liaison</i>
Tim Schnabel	Illinois, <i>Executive Director</i>

Copies of this act may be obtained from:

Uniform Law Commission
111 N. Wabash Ave., Suite. 1010
Chicago, IL 60602
312 450-6600
www.uniformlaws.org

Public Meetings During Emergencies Act

Table of Contents

Section 1. Title	1
Section 2. Definitions.....	1
Section 3. Authorization of Virtual Meetings of Public Bodies During Emergencies	2
Section 4. Conduct of a Virtual Meeting of a Public Body	3
Section 5. Public Access to and Public Participation in Virtual Meetings	5
Section 6. Quasi-Adjudicative Proceedings.....	6
Section 7. Savings Clause	7
Section 8. Transitional Provision.....	7
[Section 9. Severability].....	8
Section 10. Repeals; Conforming Amendments.....	8
Section 11. Effective Date	8

1 **Public Meetings During Emergencies Act**

2 **Section 1. Title**

3 This [act] may be cited as the Public Meetings During Emergencies Act.

4 **Reporter’s Note**

5 There are two issues concerning the title of the act. One is about the scope of the act. Is it
6 is limited to public health emergencies or does it apply to all emergencies? As the title of the
7 drafting committee refers to “public meetings during emergencies the “public health” limitation
8 was not added to the title but could be as the draft is revised. The second issue is whether the
9 “public meetings” in the title should be modified by the term “virtual.” That would give a clearer
10 sense of the purpose of the act, but it would make the title longer and is not in the name of the
11 drafting committee.
12

13 **Section 2. Definitions**

14 In this [act]:

15 (1) “Electronic” means relating to technology having electrical, digital, magnetic,
16 wireless, optical, electromagnetic, or similar capabilities.

17 (2) “Emergency” means an emergency that has been declared by the governor of the state
18 {insert relevant state law or laws authorizing the governor to declare an emergency} and that is
19 in effect.

20 (3) “Meeting” shall have the same definition as “meeting” in {the state’s open meeting
21 law}.

22 (4) “Person” means an individual, estate, business or nonprofit entity, [public
23 corporation, government or governmental subdivision, agency, or instrumentality,] or other legal
24 entity. [The term does not include a public corporation, government or governmental
25 subdivision, agency, or instrumentality.]

26 (5) “Public body” means any [administrative agency of the state] [public entity of the
27 state except the state legislature] that is subject to {insert the relevant state open meetings law}.

1 (6) “Record” means information that is inscribed on a tangible medium or that is stored in
2 an electronic or other medium and is retrievable in perceivable form.

3 (7) “Virtual meeting” means a meeting of a public body conducted by electronic means.
4 “Virtually” has a corresponding meaning.

5 **Reporter’s Note**

6
7 The Public Meetings During Emergencies Act is intended to build on and fit into existing
8 state laws authorizing the declaration of emergencies and subjecting public meetings to various
9 procedural and public access requirements, particularly open meetings laws. Consequently,
10 rather than define “emergency,” “meeting,” or “public body,” or “public meeting,” the Act cross-
11 references the relevant state laws. An alternative approach would be to define these terms.
12

13 One question is whether the Act applies to *all* public entities of the state subject to the
14 state’s open meetings requirements – which, in many states, will include local governments – or
15 only to *state-level* administrative agencies. There was considerable discussion and disagreement
16 within the drafting committee at the December 17, 2020 meeting as to whether to include local
17 governments in this Act. This draft presents two alternatives. The first – ‘administrative agency’
18 – takes the narrower approach of limiting coverage to just state administrative agencies. That
19 excludes both the state legislature and all local legislatures and local agencies. The second
20 alternative includes all public entities within the state except for the state legislature. In many
21 states, the legislatures have adopted or are currently in the process of adopting their own rules for
22 the conduct of virtual meetings. In some states, the open meetings law applies to the state
23 legislature, so the proposed definition excludes the legislature. So, too, in many states the open
24 meetings law applies to local legislatures and local agencies.
25

26 This draft of the act uses the term “virtual” to refer to a meeting of a public body
27 conducted by electronic means. The executive orders and state laws that have authorized such
28 meetings more commonly use the term “remote” instead of “virtual.” However, as was pointed
29 out at the December 17, 2020 meeting of the drafting committee, “remote” may imply that there
30 is a physical meeting of the public body with some members participating remotely. “Virtual”
31 makes it clearer that there is no central gathering, and that all the members are participating via
32 electronic means. Subsequent sections of the draft refer to “physical” meetings in contrast to
33 “virtual” meetings. That term is currently undefined but perhaps should be in a future draft.
34

35 **Section 3. Authorization of Virtual Meetings of Public Bodies During Emergencies**

36 During an emergency, a public body may meet virtually. If a virtual meeting of a public
37 body complies with Sections 4, 5, and 6, any action taken at such a virtual meeting will have the
38 same legal force and effect as an action taken at a physical meeting of the public body. All other

1 laws of the state that would apply to the physical meeting of a public body shall, to the extent
2 feasible, apply to a virtual meeting of the public body.

3 **Reporter's Note**

4 This draft of section 3 authorizes a public body to meet virtually automatically on the
5 governor's declaration of an emergency and for the duration of that emergency. An alternative
6 approach would require that the governor's emergency declaration specifically include an
7 authorization for virtual meetings during the emergency.
8

9 **Section 4. Conduct of a Virtual Meeting of a Public Body**

10 (a) Except as provided in subsection (b), at a virtual meeting each member of the public
11 body in attendance must be able to see and hear, and to be seen and heard, throughout the
12 meeting by every other member of the public body who is attending the meeting simultaneously.

13 A member of the public body shall be considered present for all purposes, including the
14 determination of a quorum and for voting, as if the member were physically present at a physical
15 meeting of the public body, while the member can see and hear and be seen and heard by the
16 other members of the public body.

17 (b) If the public body lacks the technological capacity to provide for simultaneous visual
18 contact for its members, the body may conduct a virtual meeting by electronic means that
19 provides audio access such that each member of the public body in attendance is able to hear and
20 be heard throughout the meeting by the other members of the public body who are attending the
21 meeting simultaneously. Any member of the public body who can hear and be heard by the other
22 members of the public body shall be considered present for all purposes, including the
23 determination of a quorum and for voting as if the member were physically present at a physical
24 meeting of the body. Any member of the public body who participates in a virtual meeting
25 through electronic means that provide only such audio connection to the meeting shall identify
26 himself or herself before speaking or voting.

1 (c) Any document or exhibit to be considered at a virtual meeting shall be provided to
2 each member of the public body.

3 (d) The notice for a virtual meeting of a public body shall indicate that it will be a virtual
4 meeting, why the public body is meeting virtually, the technology used for the meeting, and the
5 means by which members of the public body may attend the meeting.

6 (e) The minutes of a virtual meeting shall reflect that the meeting was conducted by
7 electronic means, the type of means use, which members were participating by electronic means,
8 when each member joined or left the virtual meeting, and any interruption in or suspension of the
9 meaning due to technical problems with the electronic means supporting the meeting.

10 (f) Every public body may adopt rules to implement the provisions of this Section for the
11 conduct of virtual meetings with the purpose of making the conduct of a virtual meeting of a
12 public body as comparable to the conduct of a physical meeting of that body as possible. Such
13 rules may include, but are not limited to, all of the following:

14 (1) specifying the means for confirming the identity of a member of the public
15 body attending the virtual meeting by electronic means that provide an audio but not a visual
16 connection to the meeting under Section 4(b); and

17 (2) addressing the effects on the conduct of a virtual meeting of any technical
18 problems that interfere with the electronic means supporting the virtual meeting or the
19 connection of any member of the public body to the meeting.

20 **Reporter's Note.**
21

22 The provisions of this Section derive from some of the gubernatorial executive orders or
23 state laws authorizing remote public meetings, most of which were adopted in 2020. These
24 include: Ky SB 150, ch. 73, Ls of 2020; Me. Rev. Stat. tit. 1, § 403-A; Michigan Gov. E.O.
25 2020-154 (July 17, 2020); Mich. Comp. L .Ann. § 15.263a; N.J.S.A. § 52:27D-18.11; N.C. Gen.
26 Stat. § 166A-19.24; Va Code Ann. § 2.2-3708.2.
27

1 **Section 5. Public Access to and Public Participation in Virtual Meetings**

2 (a) For any meeting of a public body that would be subject to any other law of this state
3 providing for public access if held as a physical meeting, a virtual meeting of the public body
4 shall provide comparable access to the public to the maximum extent possible.

5 (1) If any other law of the state provides that members of the public shall be able
6 to see and hear a meeting of the public body as it occurs, the public body shall give such notice
7 of the meeting as is required by such law. The notice shall also specify the electronic means by
8 which the public can access the virtual meeting as it occurs. If at such a public meeting, members
9 of the public are entitled to observe any documents or exhibits presented to the public body, such
10 documents or exhibits shall, to the extent practicable given the technology being utilized, be
11 made available for public observation by electronic means at a virtual meeting.

12 (2) If pursuant to Section 4(b), the virtual meeting is conducted through electronic
13 means that provides only an audio connection, public access may be limited to an audio
14 connection as well.

15 (3) If under a law of the state providing for a public access to a public meeting,
16 such public access consists only of the public's right to examine a record of the meeting after the
17 meeting has occurred, a record of the virtual meeting shall be made available to the public within
18 the same time period and in the same format as required for a physical meeting of the public
19 body.

20 (b) If under a law of the state governing the meetings of a public body, members of the
21 public have the right to submit comments, that right shall also be available at a virtual meeting.
22 The notice of the meeting shall provide directions for members of the public to submit
23 comments, which may include written comments or oral comments by electronic means.

1 (c) If under a law of the state a member of the public is required or entitled to appear
2 before the public body and participate in a public meeting, the public body shall enable such
3 person to participate in a virtual meeting using the same electronic means as the public body is
4 using to conduct the meeting. Participation in a virtual meeting by a member of the public
5 required or entitled to appear at a meeting of the public body shall be as comparable as possible
6 to such participation at a physical meeting of the public body.

7 (d) Every public body may adopt rules to implement the provisions of this Section for the
8 provision of public access to and public participation in virtual meetings with the purpose of
9 making public access and participation at a virtual meeting of the public body as comparable to
10 public access to or participation in a physical meeting of that body as possible.

11 (e) The requirements of this Section are subject to enforcement by the rules and
12 procedures of the other laws of this state providing for public access to or public participation in
13 the meetings of public bodies.

14 **Reporter's Note**
15

16 The focus of section 5 is to adapt the pre-existing law of the state with respect to public
17 access to or public participation in meetings of public bodies to virtual meetings. It does not
18 create any new rights of access or participation but seeks only to require the provision of
19 electronic means to secure the rights of access or participation already provided by state law. It
20 tracks some of the same executive orders or state legislation referred to in the Reporter's Note to
21 section 4.
22

23 **Section 6. Quasi-Adjudicative Proceedings**

24 A public body may conduct a quasi-adjudicative proceeding at a virtual meeting only if:

25 (a) The right of a person to a hearing and decision occurs during the emergency.

26 (b) Every person subject to the quasi-adjudicative proceeding who has a right to
27 participate in the quasi-adjudicative proceeding has been given notice of the quasi-adjudicative
28 proceeding and consents to do so at a virtual meeting.

1 (c) All due process rights of the parties affected by the quasi-adjudicative proceeding are
2 protected.

3 **Reporter’s Note**

4 The language of this section derives closely from N.C. Gen. Stat. § 166A-19.24(f).
5 Another law with a similar focus is Ga. Stat. § 50-13-15 (5) (“Any hearing which is required or
6 permitted hereunder may be conducted by utilizing remote telephonic communications if the
7 record reflects that all parties have consented to the conduct of the hearing by use of such
8 communications and that such procedure will not jeopardize the rights of any party to the
9 hearing.”). Quasi-adjudicative proceedings include those dealing with licenses, permits, site-
10 specific land use decisions, and other administrative actions affecting one or a very small number
11 of individuals rather than the public more generally. A New Jersey administrative rule adopted
12 by the state’s Division of Local Government concerning whether a land use board can conduct a
13 public hearing on a development application virtually requires the public body to undertake a
14 “totality of the circumstances” examination of the application to determine whether a remote
15 meeting could provide due process to all affected parties: “Before holding a public hearing on an
16 application for development during a remote public meeting, a land use board shall determine
17 whether electronic communication technology can sufficiently facilitate due process of the
18 applicant and any interested party, including the ability to examine exhibits, transcribe testimony
19 and cross-examine witnesses, as well as the ability of the public to comment upon the
20 application. Factors in making this determination shall include, at minimum, the scale of the
21 project, the number of approvals requested, the degree of public interest, and the number of
22 potential objectors.” N.J.A.C. 5:39-1.7(a).

23
24 **Section 7. Savings Clause**

25 This [act] applies only during emergencies and does not supersede any other state law
26 authorizing a public body to permit members of the body or members of the public to participate
27 in its meetings by remote means.

28 **Reporter’s Note**

29
30 A number of states have laws authorizing remote participation in public meetings of
31 individual members of a public body and some forms of remote participation by members of the
32 public. These laws assume that the meeting of the public body will be in a physical location. The
33 [act] not intended to supersede those laws but only to supplement with an authorization for an
34 entirely virtual meeting during an emergency.

35
36 **Section 8. Transitional Provision**

37 This [act] applies to a proceeding commenced on or after [the effective date of this [act]].

1 **[Section 9. Severability**

2 If any provision of this [act] or its application to any person or circumstance is held
3 invalid, the invalidity does not affect other provisions or applications of this [act] which can be
4 given effect without the invalid provision or application, and to this end the provisions of this
5 [act] are severable.]

6 ***Legislative Note:** Include this section only if this state lacks a general severability statute or a
7 decision by the highest court of this state stating a general rule of severability.*

8
9 **Section 10. Repeals; Conforming Amendments**

10 (a)

11 (b)

12 (c)

13 ***Legislative Note:** The state should examine its statutes regarding {the meetings of public bodies
14 and open meetings requirements} to determine whether conforming revisions are*

15
16 **Section 11. Effective Date**

17 This [act] takes effect